Emerald Hill master plan

Analysis of submissions

Submission	Sum	mary of the submission	Offic	cer Comment on key issues / changes
Number / Interest			Reco	ommended Position / Changes to the Master Plan
1) Albert Park resident	I. II.		l. 	The change from cultural 'hub' to cultural 'heart' is recommended to be made in the Emerald Hill master plan
Position: Support /		view we are all united and share the land. Submits there needs to be a shared occupation of the South Melbourne Town Hall	II.	Buljil's welcome to country is recommended to be incorporated in the final Emerald Hill master plan if permission to use the welcome to country has been received from local elder Aunty Carolyn
Specific Comment		Submits that this area could be a tourist destination like Sovereign Hill. Refers to 1905 book showing photos of all the shops.	III.	1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1
Verbal submission	V.	stark contrast with heritage. Submits that a better way to express is	IV.	environment in the final Emerald Hill master plan.
submission		an "opportunity for CoPP to engage in projects to show how to draw from heritage". Offers Louvre pyramid by I.M.Pei as a good example as it does not touch the historic building. Prefers to words	V.	On page 20 "provide a contemporary counterpoint, whilst remaining complementary to heritage, in line with Burra Charter and Council heritage policy". Proposed change to: "Provide
	VI.	'exemplary and respectful' instead of counterpoint and contemporary. Note that The Ballantyne room was used solidly by the community	VI.	exemplary designed and respectful new built elements, in line with Burra Charter and Council heritage policy" Noted. No change to master plan required
		prior to ANAM lease. Ballantyne Room as a function room could be a good attractor for local area		
2) Cecil Street, South Melbourne	I.	Welcomes focus on activation. Submits activity is particularly important in the evenings. Retail shops could stay open longer to tie in with an event.	I.	The draft master plan has an action focussing on activation (on p. 32 action 15: 'partner with community and local organisations to increase the use of the forecourt for events, market stalls,
trader and South	II.	Supports the lighting and animation piece during the cabaret festival. Consider a light show like in Gertrude Street Fitzroy where buildings		exhibitions to occur alongside current uses.' Make activation more explicit on key maps – p. 13 and 23 and in use principles p. 20 and
Melbourne business owner	III.	become the artwork. Submits that there should be a focus on Park Street and whole block integrated landscaping	II.	in actions for projects - north courtyard (performance space) The Cabaret festival lighting could be used as an example in the lighting section of the master plan. Cabaret Festival agreement
Position: Support /	IV.	Requests that sporting clubs / facilities be involved. South Melbourne has a proud sporting history and some great venues.	III.	has been received. The South Melbourne Structure Plan provides guidance on the
Specific Comment	V.	Suggests 1905, 1970s and current day bike rider display. Suggests that shops may need to reinvent themselves to stay competitive, and Council just needs to rebuild the area as a		precinct bounded by Clarendon, Park, Cecil and Dorcas streets. To avoid duplication the Emerald Hill master plan will focus on public realm around the town hall and within the Emerald Hill
Verbal submission		destination. Gives an example of Chez Drè located in a nearby laneway between Coventry and Hotham Street is a destination in itself	IV.	precinct. Add a new principle of using heritage as a setting to modern activities.

Submission	Summary of the submission	Officer Comment on key issues / changes
Number / Interest		Recommended Position / Changes to the Master Plan
		V. Noted. No change to master plan required
3) James Service Place, South Melbourne resident Position: Specific Comment	Asks about the current uses of the South Melbourne Town Hall and whether it is nearly empty.	The current use of the building have been summarised and a letter of response has been sent.
Verbal submission		
4) James Service Place, South Melbourne resident Position: Specific Comment Verbal	Misses the chimes of the South Melbourne town Hall clock between 11pm and 6am. The sound has been off for about a year now.	No change to the master plan is required.
submission		
5) Bank Street, Arts organisation South Melbourne Position: Support / Specific Comment Verbal submission	 I. Suggests the Embed at principle level a spirit of sharing to encourage partnership/ ownership / celebration and community pride for projects / to celebrate together and rejoice in what we have. II. Suggests that Council support a change the name of the number 1 tram to "arts tram" III. Recommends the master plan include an activation project in the principles to promote the stories and curiosity IV. States that they are waiting for the forecourt, and will be able to use it for performances and artists' markets. The South Melbourne Festival could be held at the forecourt – just need power supply 	 Add a principle about the spirit of sharing and celebration of community pride in final Emerald Hill master plan. Encourage discussions with Yarra Trams to progress this idea. The draft master plan has an action focussing on activation (on p. 32 action 15: 'partner with community and local organisations to increase the use of the forecourt for events, market stalls, exhibitions to occur alongside current uses.' Make activation more explicit on key maps – pages 13 and 23 and in use principles page 20 and in actions for projects - north courtyard (performance space) Noted. No change to master plan required
6) Park Street, Real Estate agent South Melbourne	Suggests that Council should concentrate on building maintenance and cleaning of pigeon poo etc. Questions who will use the forecourt	Noted. No change to master plan required. During the consultation, we have heard from local trader, arts groups and a community group who are all interested in using the forecourt

Submission Number /	Summary of the submission	Officer Comment on key issues / changes
Interest		Recommended Position / Changes to the Master Plan
Position: Objection Verbal submission		
7) Bank Street, Arts organisation South Melbourne Position: Support Verbal submission	 I. Supports public transport and CoPP position as described in the master plan II. Supports increased green in the forecourt 	Noted. No change to master plan required Noted. No change to master plan required
8) Graham Street, Port Melbourne resident Position: Support / Specific Comment Verbal submission	 I. Submits that the inclusion of European history on page18 and lighting on page 46 is a good idea II. Submits that careful consideration is required about side entries 	Noted. No change to master plan required II. Any future changes to the side entries will be carefully considered and developed in line with the Burra Charter and Council heritage policy.
9) Page Street, Middle Park resident Position: Support /	Submits that front door should continue to be used for community access. There needs to be careful consideration about the design side entries Supports Indigenous history and page 11 library forecourt	The front door is open during trading hours. The front door will continue to be used for events and Council meetings. Any future changes to the side entries will be carefully considered and developed in line with the Burra Charter and Council heritage policy.
Specific Comment Verbal submission	III. Requests that process for booking the auditorium be included on page 19	II. Noted. No change to master plan required III. The booking process is continuing to be refined to facilitate community access. As the master plan is a long term document and the booking process may change, no change required. A letter explaining the booking process will be made available to consultation participants.

Submission	Summary of the submission	Officer Comment on key issues / changes
Number / Interest		Recommended Position / Changes to the Master Plan
10) Dorcas Street, South Melbourne resident Position: Issue Specific Objection Verbal submission	 I. Raises concerns about impact on residents when Marshall Street closed and during the additional use of the Ballantyne Room II. Raises concerns about large trees III. Supports the images used on page 31 	community prior to ANAM's tenancy. Temporary closure of Marshall Street is planned to be used for community events. Any event would require a permit from Council's traffic and events team. The extended operation of Ballantyne Room would require a planning permit. Licensing and footpath trading would be covered by Council's Local Laws and Environmental Acts. I. Trees will not block the Perrins Street vista of the Town Hall clock tower. The trees for the forecourt will be selected for the soil conditions and requirements of being deciduous and celebrate the seasons.
44) 5: 1		II. Noted. No change to master plan required
11) Richardson Street, Middle Park resident Position: Issue Specific Objection Written submission	 Raises concerns about whether public seating will be used and whether public seating will encourage alcohol abuse and sleeping. Does not support parking reduction. Submits that angle parking is preferable to parallel parking. Quotes an increase in car ownershi in Port Phillip (ABS: Census 2001 & 2006). Submits that South Melbourne Town Hall should generate a large income for ratepayers, like the successful Melbourne GPO. This would bring more people to the plaza whereas a few artists and festivals will change nothing. Submits that if this proposal goes ahead in its current form it with a costly white elephant Submits that European history (p. 18) is an incorrect term, should be British settlement or post contact settlement to include early Chinese migrants 	spaces in the precinct to better plan the forecourt. No change to master plan required. II. There are a number of options to address car parking: • maintain the current car parking around the south Melbourne Town Hall. This option does not address the need to improve accessibility around the Town Hall building and is a poor long term option. • Implement the car parking reduction proposed and adv9ocate for the Sustainable Transport Plan and leave any additional parking to be provided through future developments in the retail centre (preferred option).
		IV. All projects / actions in the master plan will apply for funding in the standard Council budget bid process. Value for money is addressed by a form principle on page 20 – "design public realm improvements to be physically robust, for ease of repair and relatively low levels of maintenance."

Submission Number / Interest	Summary of the submission	Officer Comment on key issues / changes Recommended Position / Changes to the Master Plan
		The proposed term sounds awkward and the European history heading will be retained.
12) Raglan Street, South Melbourne resident Position: Issue Specific Comment Verbal submission 13) Cecil Street, South Melbourne traders group Position: Issue Specific Objection Verbal	Suggests that asphalt print on page 35 needs to be more subtle and that stone paving would be excellent Submits that trees have not been well looked after but more would be good, would like longer lasting trees not Robinias (pea flower deciduous tree) Raises concerns about amount of money to subsidise Marshall Street works	 I. The patterns of asphalt print are examples from other projects. These are not the designs being proposed for this precinct. A design will be commissioned for the South Melbourne Town Hall precinct. Paving materials will be chosen based on durability, sustainability, appearance and Council's maintenance practices. The current budget does not allow for a full stone paving treatment of the precinct. II. Trees will not block the Perrins Street vista of the Town Hall clock tower. The trees for the forecourt will be selected for the soil conditions and requirements of being deciduous and celebrate the seasons. All projects / actions in the master plan will apply for funding in the standard Council budget process. Value for money is addressed by a form principle on page 20 – "design public realm improvements to be physically robust, for ease of repair and relatively low levels of maintenance."
submission 14) South Port	Support the forestion of a silver to and a constraint bulk! the same	Noted No shapes to master plan required
Community Housing Group South Melbourne community group Position:	the 'creation of a vibrant arts and community hub' through:	Noted. No change to master plan required
Support / Specific Comment	Cont:	

Submission Number /	Summary of the submission	Officer Comment on key issues / changes
Interest		Recommended Position / Changes to the Master Plan
Written submission	North Courtyard Projects -	
	Impressed by the artist's impression of Marshall Street and Layfield/Daly Streets on page 15 and support the development of an outdoor café in this space.	
	Supports Ballantyne Room - Use of function centre or restaurant, and additional outdoor seating	
	Supports the improvement of entrances to the Town Hall in relation to the need to give the Town Hall more community appeal.	
	Supports Town Hall Side Entries - Improved way-finding signage, More visible western entrance, Fishley St, and Upgrade Layfield Street entrance	
	Support for Forecourt People do sit in forecourt having lunch	Forecourt Anecdotal evidence of current forecourt use. No change to document required.
	We support the redevelopment of this space to make it a more pleasant spot for workers to have lunch on the grass. We also support the closure of the street and parking spaces in front of the Town Hall as it inhibits the usefulness of the space for the public and pedestrians and creates confusion and danger for pedestrians crossing Bank Street.	
	Support Town Hall Forecourt - Involve community in increasing use of forecourt, Create large accessible area for events, Create formal open space to complement Town Hall, Increase shade and landscaping, Include grassed areas for lounging	
	Car parking I. Support Road space, car parking, and pedestrian amenity - Remove parking spaces in Bank St (forecourt). Do not support the removal of parking spaces in Layfield, Fishley and Daly Streets. Lack of parking Cont:	Car parking There are a number of options to address car parking: • maintain the current car parking around the south Melbourne Town Hall. This option does not address the need to improve accessibility around the Town Hall building and is a poor long term option.

Submission	Summary of the submission	Officer Comment on key issues / changes
Number / Interest		Recommended Position / Changes to the Master Plan
	in the area particularly on market days makes it hard for us to function. II. We support the redevelopment of Marshall Street to facilitate occasional closure for public events. We would actually love the idea of having this space available for public events that would develop community. We are impressed by the artist's impression of Marshall Street and Layfield/Daly Streets on page 15 of the Master Plan document.	 Implement the car parking reduction proposed and adv9ocate for the Sustainable Transport Plan and leave any additional parking to be provided through future developments in the reta centre (preferred option).
Supports Lighting and Safety - Light up the Bank St Town Hall facade Town Hall which are in close proximity to replan to recommend further consultation with properties. There is no proposal to light up to recommend consultation with people who live in Layfield Street and facades of the South Melbourne Town Hall	Lighting Further consultation will be carried out prior to lighting the facades of the Town Hall which are in close proximity to residential properties. Master	
	plan to recommend further consultation with adjoining residential properties. There is no proposal to light up Fishley and Layfield Street facades of the South Melbourne Town Hall. Additional lighting in Daly Street will be carried out subject to consultation.	
	has a very significant place in the history of Australia and inter-government relations, with the purchase of the whole estate by the Whitlam recommended that this be recognised in historian, Kay Rowan has written a sho	The public housing history of this precinct is unique and it is recommended that this be recognised in the master plan. Council's historian, Kay Rowan has written a short history of public housing in the Emerald Hill precinct. It is recommended that this be included in the
	Public seating Submits that the provision of public seating in Dorcas Street has been controversial. Council has in the past removed seats in response to public complaints. Complaints have been about 'undesirables' (community housing and public housing tenants) using the seats. Suggests that this is a result of the population having become socioeconomically polarised. Submits that some tenants do like to use public seating when available. Cont:	Public seating We take the view that public space should feel welcoming to all users. We are carrying out qualitative research into the use of the precinct's public space for recreational purposes such as sitting, lounging etc. A summary of this research will be included in the master plan. This will provide important information for the design of improved public spaces in the future.

Submission Number / Interest	Summary of the submission	Officer Comment on key issues / changes Recommended Position / Changes to the Master Plan
	222 Bank Street Submits that does not know who the arts organisations in 222 Bank Street are. Submits that precinct art groups could be better-utilised and better-promoted.	222 Bank Street Council officers will introduce arts organisations to community groups.
	Supports the facilitation of universal access and vertical garden at 222 Bank Street Library Submits that would like to be involved in the design of the Library, as access to the internet is beyond the financial capacity of most people on government pensions and benefits.	Library The Library design team has been made aware that this community group would like to be involved in the Library project.
15) Park Street, South Melbourne business owner and resident Position: Issue Specific Objection Written submission	 Does not support reduction in car parking as this will have a major effect of local business and residences. Submits that the main concern is the loss of car spaces on Park Place, behind 282 Park Street, which would affect the submitter as a resident and business owner. Currently three staff use these car spaces and fears they may leave if parking is not available. Also inconvenient to the family if need to park far from home. Supports the upgrade of the forecourt of the town hall and town hall itself 	 I. There are a number of options to address car parking: maintain the current car parking around the south Melbourne Town Hall. This option does not address the need to improve accessibility around the Town Hall building and is a poor long term option. Implement the car parking reduction proposed and adv9ocate for the Sustainable Transport Plan and leave any additional parking to be provided through future developments in the retail centre (preferred option). II. There are no plans to reduce parking numbers behind 282 Park Street (in the park behind the Police Station). III. Noted. No change to master plan required
16) Park Street, South Melbourne business owner Position: Issue Specific Objection	 I. Does not support the reduction of car parking, for the commercial area of South Melbourne to advance and remain viable it is essential to maintain and enhance the access to the area. Request a clarification about the future of parking along the southern side of the park in Park Place. II. Submits that the needs of the traders, commercial operators and the residents have not been fully considered in this master plan. There Cont: 	There are no plans to reduce parking numbers behind 282 Park Street in the park behind the Police Station. There are a number of options to address car parking: • maintain the current car parking around the south Melbourne Town Hall. This option does not address the need to improve accessibility around the Town Hall building and is a poor long term option.

Submission Number /	Summary of the submission	Officer Comment on key issues / changes
Interest		Recommended Position / Changes to the Master Plan
Written submission	has been no consultation prior to formulating this plan. Submits that nothing further should be done and certainly no further expenditure take place until a clear understanding of the needs of those affected by the master plan area clearly defined.	Implement the car parking reduction proposed and adv9ocate for the Sustainable Transport Plan and leave any additional parking to be provided through future developments in the retail centre (preferred option). III. A late submission has been permitted to allow traders extra time after the busy Christmas period. A late submission has been received from the South Melbourne traders group.
17) Park Street, Arts organisation South Melbourne Verbal submission	Submits that the local arts organisations would be interested in an artist in residence at the former fire station master's residence	Council has not yet decided whether the former fire station master residence is to be leased. It is currently used by Council for storage.
18) Melbourne	Consultation timing	Consultation timing
Business property owner	Submits that traders have not been aware of consultation and would like to be put in a group response after deadline by end of January 2012.	A late submission has been permitted to allow traders extra time after the busy Christmas period.
Position: Issue Specific Objection Written submission	 Streetscape Submits that the Emerald Hill precinct needs to improve aesthetically to compete with neighbouring centres by: Repainting verandas affixed to buildings overhanging Council owned paving Providing interesting and updated paving on footpath corners Increasing lighting under verandas and near shopfronts Removing the Mulberry Trees on the footpaths. Use of Town Hall building Submits that some local government functions should be returned to the Town Hall, which will then act to draw users to the area Suggests that Emerald Hill be used as part of the identity for the area 	 Verandas attached to privately owned buildings would need to be maintained by the property owner. Council aims to create a vibrant, engaging environment in this precinct. This would involve public realm improvements i.e. improved footpaths, roads, tree planting, and public furniture. The lighting in Clarendon Street is within the guidelines of the Public Lighting Network for this area. There is a planned changeover of street lighting (from yellow to white light) in this area. Installation date is to be confirmed by Citipower. Further improvements could be investigated after a lighting audit. The mulberry trees in Clarendon Street are outside the scope of the master plan.
	Cont:	 Use of Town Hall building There are currently no plans to return Council staff to the South

Submission	Summary of the submission	Officer Comment on key issues / changes
Number / Interest		Recommended Position / Changes to the Master Plan
	Access and transport I. Does not support removal of parking spaces II. Suggests that parking bays for the off-street car park on Park Street be better defined III. Suggests that parking time for all car parking be increased from one hour or less to two / three hours. IV. Submits that going to Clarendon Street should be made as simple and easy as possible by: Allowing traffic to flow through Bank Street at Moray Street. Removing Hook-Turns throughout Clarendon Street Working with Government and Yarra Trams to connect Park Street to St Kilda Road.	Melbourne Town Hall building. However, every third Council meeting is held at the South Melbourne Town Hall. The lease with ANAM allows for as many community events to be held at the Town Hall as practical around the ANAM performance calendar. The Town Hall is also used for citizenship ceremonies. • Add a principle to the master plan about using the history/brand of Emerald Hill as an identity for the whole precinct **Access and transport** I. There are a number of options to address car parking: • maintain the current car parking around the south Melbourne Town Hall. This option does not address the need to improve accessibility around the Town Hall building and is a poor long term option. • Implement the car parking reduction proposed and adv9ocate for the Sustainable Transport Plan and leave any additional parking to be provided through future developments in the retail centre (preferred option). II. Line marking between bays is purposefully avoided as it reduces the number of car parking spaces available. The existing line marking will be checked and maintained if required. III. Traffic and Parking Design have advised that it is good traffic practice to limit the time allowed for on-street parking to provide a service to access immediate businesses in the short term and encourage the use of off street parking, such as at the market or shopping centre for longer parking periods. Longer term parking will be assisted with dynamic parking signs which will be installed in April 2012. Council can make available a "Procedure Manual" for businesses to request a change to current parking practice. IV. Broader works beyond the precinct are required to improve pedestrian access to South Melbourne. Council is aware of pedestrian connectivity issues and the barriers of St Kilda Road / Kingway. Council is working on addressing these barriers through St Kilda Road Review Public Transport Study and Urban Linkages Study.

Submission Number / Interest	Summary of the submission	Officer Comment on key issues / changes Recommended Position / Changes to the Master Plan
	Forecourt design Professor Melbourne from Monash University to provide advice on wind in	 Traffic and Parking Design have advised that the intersection between Bank and Moray was an accident prone junction. The road closure was funded through by VicRoads. Re-opening Bank Street at Moray Street is not being considered. Hook turns in Clarendon Street are outside the scope of the master plan. Council is committed to advocating for the missing link of the Park Street tram between Moray and Kings Way. Forecourt design A wind study will be considered to test the design of the forecourt. No
	forecourt.	change to master plan required.
19) South Melbourne resident Verbal	I. Asks how many car parking spaces are specifically reserved for Council use only II. Questions whether a traffic plan been done?	 No change to master plan required. There are three spaces in Daly Street near Fishley Street that are dedicated for construction vehicles. These will be changed to general parking.
submission Position: Issue Specific Objection	III. Asks who owns the car park behind Clarendon Street and whether Council is buying this land	 III. A traffic plan has not been carried out. III. Department of Human Services owns the car park behind Clarendon Street. Council has decided to purchase this land to: Assist in providing activity to Emerald Hill lane To support the function of laneways as connections through the precinct To provide much needed public open space in South Melbourne